

# E-Commerce Policy of Pakistan: Setting a Path to Development

Amtul Matin<sup>\*</sup>, Amara Awan<sup>\*\*</sup>, Dr. Kashif Mahmood<sup>\*\*\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Ph.D. Scholar, Faculty of Business and Management Sciences, Superior University, Lahore, Pakistan

<sup>2</sup> Ph.D. Scholar, Faculty of Business and Management Sciences, Superior University, Lahore, Pakistan

<sup>3</sup> Assistant Professor, Faculty of Business and Management Sciences, Superior University, Lahore, Pakistan

---

## KEYWORDS

Electronic Commerce,  
Information Technologies,  
Ecosystem for E  
Commerce,  
Global Connectivity,  
E-Commerce Platforms

## ABSTRACT

**Introduction:** Since e-commerce is becoming more important in many sectors, many emerging and developing countries have made steps to standardize it in order to guide the evolution of the internet economy and make it advantageous to their citizens. The existing policy response is as per the expectations as an unprecedented growth has been witnessed in recent years both at the country level and across border trade through E-Commerce platforms. We share here i) gaps related to the ecosystem of the e-commerce sector in Pakistan, and ii) prioritization of existing policy and research concerns.

**Methods:** Exploratory research was carried out using national and international online business perspectives and applying the e-commerce policy framework for equitable access to essential ecosystem, consumer protection, multicultural negotiations, and global connectivity. Methods involved key informant interviews with experts/stakeholders.

**Findings:** Most of the findings for the e-commerce policy implementation yielded positive effects. These include the utilization of available resources and ecosystem, the regulatory and legal infrastructure for e-commerce business registration, and the backing of appropriate government agencies. However, in some areas like Trust, Cyber security laws, E Scams and frauds, and dispute resolution mechanisms, it was found that policy implementation is weak.

**Conclusion:** To drive the expansion of e-Commerce, comprehensive actions are needed, including addressing legislative inconsistencies, guaranteeing a level playing field for all stakeholders in the e-Commerce market, transparency in e-commerce industries' economic activities, and harmonizing tax systems, to mention a few.

---

## 1. Introduction

The Internet has profoundly transformed the business landscape and created new opportunities for businesses worldwide. This digital revolution has given rise to the phenomenon of electronic commerce (e-commerce), spurred by the global proliferation of information technologies. Despite the fact that the Internet was widely used in 1994, e-commerce did not become a phenomenon in developed countries until 2000. E-commerce is a broad term that encompasses all types of commercial transactions involving the processing and transmission of digitized data, such as text, voice, and visual pictures. It is applicable to practically any sort of commercial

interaction and extends beyond the confines of a single company.

E-commerce has enormous prospects for both developed and developing countries. Market access to far-flung locations, speedy interchange of products and services, safe payments, stimulating innovation, and providing job possibilities are among them. It has the potential to allow the developing world to make significant progress on the route to socioeconomic and technological growth, which it missed out during the industrial revolution. Consequently, e-commerce plays an undeniable role in improving our daily lives. The intense advancement of communication technology via internet has further eroded the barriers, boundaries and geographical gap between countries in economic

activities, thus ensuring a more accessible and safer global trade mechanism .

According to, statistics also show the phenomenal success of the e-commerce industry in such a short period of time. In 2021, global retail e-commerce sales were forecasted to total over 4.9 trillion dollars and the value predicted to climb by 50% over the following four years, reaching \$7.4 trillion by 2025 .

Before entrusting any firm, consumers evaluate several criteria. Similarly, personal data protection laws, secure cross-border trading mechanisms, payment gateway availability, a flexible taxation structure, modern Information and Communications Technology (ICT) services, and consumer protection are all necessary for establishing and maintaining the e-commerce industry. However, due to obstacles such as cognitive, economic, and sociopolitical concerns, many underdeveloped and developing countries are finding it difficult to integrate e-commerce .

Pakistan is one of the economies where digitization is causing changes in various service sector components. . E-Commerce has the potential to improve livelihoods, increase enterprise competitiveness, and boost Pakistan's share of global trade among other developing countries. To raise the share of global trade and close the digital divide between industrialized and developing nations, it is necessary to take activities that strengthen local capabilities both qualitatively and quantitatively . However , along with other key hurdles, trust deficit, inefficient payment mechanisms, lack of awareness about complex legal procedures, inadequate consumer personal and financial data protection laws, absence of fair and smooth bilateral relationships for cross border trade and fragile cyber security laws against e scams are some of the fundamental challenges facing by the e-commerce industry in Pakistan and promote a negative impact on the expansion and development of Pakistan's e-commerce sector.

## **2. Settings - Pakistani Perspective**

Pakistan is the 46th largest e-Commerce market in the world, with revenue of \$4 billion expected

in 2020 . Pakistan's e-commerce industry is rapidly expanding, with the potential to boost the country's economy by expanding job opportunities, linking rural areas to the rest of the country, promoting small and medium companies, and increasing exports through online platforms. . Despite 38 million Internet mobile users, Pakistani e-commerce is still in its infancy, with little Internet retail transactions . However, it is a growing industry, with an increase in online sellers, local E-Commerce platforms, and online payment services offered by banks and significant cellular providers in recent years. Within very short span of time, the number of registered e-commerce merchants has increased by 2.6 times, while e-commerce payments have increased by 2.3 times . Ecommerce businesses such as daraz.pk, pakwheels.com, and others are already thriving in Pakistan, indicating that the country's expanding e-commerce sector has a bright future. Pakistan also leads South Asia in mobile banking transactions. The expanding IT sector, population growth, and the amount of people using the internet have all contributed to this goal to some extent . The government has proactively taken certain measures aimed at fostering the growth of the e-commerce and ICT sectors, laying the foundation for their expansion. E-commerce policy and Digital Pakistan policy are major initiatives in this regard . The evolving digital payment infrastructure and e-commerce transactions underscore the sector's promising growth prospects. According to the data reported by , the e-commerce business in Pakistan witnessed 35% growth in the first quarter of 2021, to 96 billion Pakistani rupees (\$548.89 million), up from 71 billion rupees (\$405.95 million) the previous year. Pakistan has diligently built a strong information and communications sector over the last two decades by embracing liberalization, particularly in the broadcasting sector to aid the expansion of the IT-enabled service economy i.e. e-commerce sector. In Pakistan, 175.62 million mobile phone users and 118.80 million fixed broadband customers were exposed to e commerce during 2020-21 . According to , Pakistan's information technology exports might expand by 25% by 2022. Pakistan,

with a population of over 200 million people aged 15 to 29, has immense human and intellectual capital. There are about 5000 IT companies and call centers in Pakistan, and the number is expanding every year. Pakistan boasts 13 software technology parks and over 300,000 English-speaking IT experts with expertise in current and developing IT products and technologies. Each year, over 20,000 IT graduates and engineers are generated, along with a growing startup culture. While the sector has grown in recent decades, it is still in its immaturity in Pakistan and requires substantial, intelligent, and logical policy involvement. To reap the benefits of a well-functioning e-commerce sector, It's critical to develop a strategy that focuses on lowering the barrier to entry for businesses into the e-Commerce settings by guaranteeing protection of the consumer, the mechanism for electronic payments, and cross-border connectivity of goods and service providers, thereby boosting the digital economy at both the local and global levels.

In the light of this, the Ministry of Commerce formed an "e-commerce Policy Board" and notified five working groups (taxation, payment infrastructure, regulatory framework, logistics, and ecommerce, WTO & development) to work on various aspects of the policy. The Pakistan first e-commerce policy was approved and launched in October 2019. Presently Commerce Division of MOITT is the custodian of the policy and has constituted a National e-Commerce Council (NECC), which works as a single window for policy oversight to facilitate e-Commerce players (Stakeholders). The policy addresses and provides guidance on key elements for the promotion of e-commerce, such as "the regulatory environment, financial inclusion and digitization through payment infrastructure, empowering youth and SMEs, consumer protection, taxation, ICT infrastructure, logistics, data sovereignty, and participation in multilateral negotiations".

The objectives of this study are (i) to assess and examine the progress and challenges of e-Commerce Policy of the country and (ii) to critically review the implementation of the E

Commerce Policy of Pakistan. Following that is the paper's methodology section, which is followed by the analysis and results, as well as recommendations.

### **3. Methodology**

The current study employed phenomenological approach to qualitative research and semi-structured interview technique is used for conducting the interviews with experts/practitioners. This study is aimed at to examine both good and negative policy implementation effects on problem-solving in the e-commerce sector, as well as its inadequacies in achieving expected improvement in Pakistan. Thus, qualitative methods help to reveal extensive, descriptive material on policy operations as well as the experiences and perceptions of those involved in the policy, such as key actors/stakeholders and intended beneficiaries.

### **4. Ethics Statement**

Ethical concerns were addressed before beginning the interview process. Each interviewee was contacted through email prior to the interview to get their consent and willingness to participate. They asked that their identities (names) be kept hidden. We did, however, share designations and role-playing with their permission in accordance with policy, but not their names. Interviewees' names were replaced using pseudonyms to ensure confidentiality.

### **5. Approach and Framework**

Evaluation is the process of gaining a better knowledge of a policy's merit, worth, and utility. Policy content appraisal, policy implementation assessment, policy outcome estimation, and cost & benefit analysis of the policy are the four generic forms of policy evaluation typologies identified by. The current study, took the policy implementation approach and appreciative inquiry tool as an evaluation scope of e-commerce policy. Policy evaluation criteria that

covered the eight dimensions framework were used to conduct an exploratory examination of e-commerce policy. These criteria/themes were used to assess the efficacy, efficiency, equity, political feasibility, administrative feasibility, technological feasibility, liberty/freedom, and societal acceptance of policy implementation .

## 6. Research Design

**Researchers' Stance:** In this study the researchers' stance is "for people i.e., study has an agenda" and purpose is to review and examine the progress and challenges of policy itself as well as positive and negative consequences of its implementation on problem-solving and its

shortcomings in attaining predicted improvements.

**Researchers' Expertise:** The researchers' position inside a particular research project" is defined as "positionality" (Savin-Baden & Major, 2013.). As far as the positionality of the researchers of this study is concerned, it is novice with minimal prior research experience in this field. suggested to conduct semi structured interview if the researcher is novice. As the researchers of this study are Novice , that's why semi structured questions were developed for conducting interviews from the key informant and stakeholders as depicted in the following grid.

**Researcher's Expertise Level Grid**

<b>Expert</b>	Structured Interview (expert + Less complex)	Semi Structured Interview (Expert + Complex)
<b>Novice</b>	<b>Semi Structured Interview</b> (Novice + Less complex)	UN Structured Interview (Novice + Highly complex)
	<b>Less Complex</b>	<b>Highly Complex</b>

Table 1: Source: Researcher Own Work

Moreover, the nature of problems as addressed in this study is complex (type II), here problems are clear but require authoritative strategies to develop and implement the solutions.

## 7. Key Informant Review

**Sampling Framework:** key informant for this study were selected using purposive sampling technique as previously employed by . Three Interviewees, who were regarded as expert

**Respondents' profile:** Following interviewees were finalized. As a matter of confidentiality, the identity by names of the respondents is not disclosed in the report.

### Interviewees' Profile

Respondent 1 - CEO at E-Comrades & Amazon Brand Strategist

Respondent 2 - Freelance & Fin tech Consultant in MOITT training program

Respondent 3- Brand Strategy & Neuro-marketing consultant, at Lahore Chamber

Table 2: Source: Researcher Own Work

## 8. Interview Method

According to , research interviews is an intentional conversation between two or more people in which the interviewer must establish a good relationship with the interviewee and ask open questions to which the interviewee is willing to listen carefully and respond appropriately.

### i. Interview Questions Framework:

Qualitative research questions check list as proposed by is followed to develop the questions for interview and great care was taken to avoid

the leading, double barreled and negative types of questions .

### ii. Key Stakeholders' Interviews:

The key actors and stakeholders' mapping/grid was sketched according to their interest and influence to achieve varied interests of diverse stakeholders . Key stakeholders chosen for this study were Chamber of Commerce and Trade, E commerce platforms, Digital enterprises, Freelancer service providers, and beneficiaries.

The Actors /stakeholders' grid / list constructed for this study is as follows:

### Mapping Of Stakeholders

	These will be termed as Key Actors	These will be termed as Actor but not using power)
<b>High power</b>	Ministry of Information & Telecommunication Technologies, Ministry of Commerce & Trade,	National Single Window, National E Commerce Council,
	FBR, SECP, SBP, PTA,	
	Regulatory bodies to register E commerce business, SMEDA,	
	These will be termed as stakeholder	These will be as Stakeholders but with no power
<b>Low power</b>	Third Party Logistics, cross boarder logistic entities	Ehsaas, Kamyab Jawan, Akhuwat, Agha khan
	E commerce platforms, Digital enterprises, Freelancer service providers, internet service providers	cellular companies' networks e.g. easy paisa, Jazz cash etc,
	local e commerce player including, Digital marketers, online consumer, Business incubation centers, free lancers, startups etc.	
	Highly Interested	Least Interested

Table 3: Source: Researchers Own Work

The researchers of this study conducted the interviews and took the notes/recordings on her own. Each face-to-face interview lasted between 35 to 50 minutes. All participants were also told that the interview data would be kept private and will only be utilized for this study. It would not be shared with anyone else. Following the interviews, the notes / recordings were meticulously transcribed. Subsequently, researchers examined the data to identify

common themes and patterns of meaning that come up repeatedly (Annex B).

## 9. Analysis and Results

### 9.1. Analysis

Thematic analysis is a method for studying qualitative data that comprises examining a data set for repeating patterns, understanding them, and reporting them . Following the completion of all transcripts and the researchers' note, the

interview analysis began. The information collected through interviews was sorted in eight broader dimensions/themes previously discussed in methodology section.

## **9.2. Results**

The data collected through interviews is explained and described in this section. The researchers have conducted policy implementation review analysis on the bases of policy evaluation criteria that covered eight dimensions/themes including effectiveness, efficiency, equity, political feasibility, administrative feasibility, technological feasibility, liberty/freedom, and societal acceptance.

### **9.2.1. Effectiveness:**

The major goal of E-Commerce policy is to achieve robust growth in this sector. The policy goals are quite clear and have been shown to be more than realistic and have been achieved successfully to a greater extent. The E-commerce industry has flourished very speedily in recent years especially during pandemic COVID19 and resulted in more jobs creation for freelancers, digital marketers, Women entrepreneurs etc.

While interviewing the policy stakeholders, they informed the researchers that starting an e-commerce business is very cost effective as compared to conventional business. The business registration mechanism through Single National Window (SNW) as recommended by this policy is very easy and cost effective. However, need to be implemented in true letter and spirit.

*“Entrepreneur can easily manage the costs of the online business. This policy is also facilitating registering and carrying on the business through internet and resulting in cost saving”* (R1). Another respondent shared his view as *“This Policy is facilitating in registration with platforms available both at local and international and drop-shipping service”* (R3). A comprehensive legal infrastructure for business registration both at local and international level

has been recommended by this policy and the government agencies are also fully supporting the entrance of international platforms in Pakistan and reorganization of the local platforms. The interviewee said that *“Platforms like AMAZON, offer services to merchants create business / merchant account and give exposure to the huge global / across the border market. Although it is costly to start business on Amazon platform, however, it is great opportunity for SMEs to do business comfortably”* (R3).

The implementation of this policy resulted in provision of chances for earning more than a formal business according to a respondent *“Freelancers are earning more than a formal business even of same category and volume. Formal business is limited due to geographical boundaries, marketing techniques, and approach to target consumers. These all areas require extra financing and resulted in overburden budget. Moreover, business opening closing time restriction, holidays, strikes, lock down etc. affect conventional business negatively and may result in less cost effectiveness”* (R2).

After the inception of this policy, most people having technical knowledge and required infrastructure can run their businesses affectively. However, some challenges are still there as shared by one of our interviewees, *“The supply chain management is much difficult and sometimes costly (in term of poor quality and frauds in payments too) for startups. Many improvements are still needed in traditional retail and banking infrastructure by expanding their operations in online consumer banking, fin-tech services etc”* (R3).

### **9.2.2. Efficiency**

Since Internet-based businesses can be run on a small scale, E-Commerce can assist developing-country entrepreneurs in bypassing traditional trade routes and reaching a worldwide market. This policy helps to ensure that micro, small, and medium businesses (MSMEs) that use e-commerce platforms are five times more likely to export than those in the traditional sector, according to studies. Furthermore, it is

anticipated that exporters that use digital trading platforms save up to two-thirds on costs connected with geographic distance. This could result in significant benefits for small and medium-sized businesses, as well as female-led businesses, which can now 'go global' much more readily than in the past. Around 64 percent of Pakistan's population is under the age of 29, and they are more receptive to technological advancements. It enhances the country's economy by increasing job possibilities, connecting outlying areas to the rest of the country, developing small and medium businesses, and lastly increasing exports through online platforms. *“Normally new business owners both in e commerce or linked with brick-and-mortar business are much concerned about. In my opinion, the profit margin in online business is more than the physical business”* (R3). However, in other situations, policy implementation in its entirety is still required to accomplish maximum cost-benefit analysis, as reported by one of our respondents *“Export GDP through E commerce has increased sharply in recent years. Most of the issues related to integration with logistics, payments, and markets have been addressed by this policy. After this policy it has become mandatory for a company to get registered itself with SECP. In this way the income from this business will appear in country record for GDP, per capita, tax calculation et.”* (R1)

### 9.2.3. Equity

All the major actors, stakeholders and beneficiaries were consulted while formulating this policy. This policy analyzed the perspectives and concerns of all stakeholders and provides recommendations based on them. The policy framework's suggestions are aimed at creating an enabling environment for the private sector, increasing job prospects for young and women entrepreneurs, as well as allowing the government to regulate the e-commerce sector for the benefit of the public. Despite these policy recommendations some of our interviewees showed disagreement as far as equity in process

is concerned. According to our interviewee *“It is helping in speeding up the processes but still needs to add more transparency”* (R1). While the other respondent view about policy implementation is *“WeBOC and National Single Window are helping to get all the relevant information from a single place. It is helpful and time saving for processing the whole process under one roof”* (R3).

### 9.2.4. Political Feasibility

Political interference can be divided into two categories: how political parties are linked, and whether there is a political barrier to the good of the people. There is no political impediment; basically, the development of an E-Commerce policy is a step in realizing the Government's vision and commitment to effectively support and encourage businesses to go online and stimulate comprehensive E-Commerce growth in Pakistan. As far the political obstacles for goodness of people are concerned, according to our interviewee *“Due to weak bilateral negotiation laws and geopolitical relationships, the provided incentive is not very much helpful in doing cross boarder e commerce trade. Liaison with international platforms is much more expensive compared to local”* (R1). Similarly, one of our respondents said that *“Logistics related regulations, international gateways PayPal still needs to be addressed. PayPal services are available in our neighbor country India but due to political issue, they are reluctant to come to Pakistan”* (R3).

### 9.2.5. Administrative Feasibility

The available system and mechanics required for smooth implementation of the E Commerce policy is supportive to a great extent. Nevertheless, some of the administrative issues were also highlighted by one of the expert respondents *“SBP, SECP, Ministry of IT, Ministry of Commerce are playing significantly for the implementation of E Commerce policy and for the promotion of this sector. But taxation and data protection regulations are still under*

question. Others are also very serious as E commerce is now the need of the hour and is contributing to economy up to reasonable extent” R1 & R2.

Similarly, another interviewee also shared administrative challenges regarding non availability of proper payment gateways and online banking infrastructure at grass root level and resulted in weak implementation of E commerce policy as customers still prefer to pay cash on delivery rather go online. As per our interviewee “Customer identity or financial data is a great stake due to not proper protection laws. E scamming is very common and strong cyber security laws are not available. Although this policy has recommended a strong mechanism but still not implemented in true spirit” (R1).

E courts and dispute resolution mechanisms in case of e scams, fraud or exchange/return policy is still not fully functional. While probing, the respondent replied that “I agree that some merchants tried to sale low quality products and customer can claim return but due to non-availability of e courts and regulations sellers and customers both are facing many problems.” (R2). While the other responded is of the view “The sellers included in good repute E commerce platform lists are bound to follow the dispute resolution mechanism and allow order return/exchange. Yes, e courts as recommended by this policy are functional but most of the consumers are not well aware about them. If someone face any scam through online business, I believe, he/she seldom go for legal action due to having no information” (R 2 & 3).

Logistics play major role here especially in exports. This area is still not up to the mark. “Private courier might be not cost effective for small value items. But if Pakistan post offer cheap courier services across the border, then no doubt it would help to increase the personal income as well GDP of the country” R3.

### **9.2.6. Technical Feasibility**

Technical glitches can hinder the way of implementation of the policy. Due to developments in information technology, as well

as the expansion of internet access and online banking, online businesses in Pakistan have exploded in recent years. All our three respondents were agreed that technical support and role of IT sector in implementing the E Commerce policy for achieving its objective are very rigorous. This also exhibited in their responses, “People having digital gadgets, access to internet, 4G 5G access, Digital payments mechanism, laptops etc. empower youth in doing their businesses conveniently. Effects of IT revolution, its quick adoption by youth, female entrepreneur and SME are very positive” (R1). Likewise, “IT is the backbone of E Commerce. Without having proper equipment, you cannot think about online business. Government has announced a big relief of taxation on import of IT infrastructure that is facilitating the small businesses, female entrepreneur, and SMEs at greater extent” (R2). Our 3<sup>rd</sup> respondent’s views were almost in favor for implementing the policy. According to her, “I perceived the digital revolution as the result of boost in IT sector successfully provide almost an equal playing field for the masses across the country and is really helping in implanting the E Commerce policy at a rapid speed” (R3).

### **9.2.7. Liberty/Freedom**

Along with IT revolution in Pakistan the chances of digital frauds have also increased tremendously. Unfortunately, such issues like digital data protection weaknesses, financial data security, frequent happening of e scams and weak e dispute resolution mechanisms etc. are hindering the process of implementing the policy. Both the customer and seller are not feeling secure in doing electronic transactions freely. Fraud regarding quality and quantity of order placed or in payments are very frequent and restricts the freedom to select online transactions. E courts, rules and laws are functioning but most of the sellers and customers are not well aware that how to approach them. While answering the question, one of the respondents said that “Customer identity or financial data is at great stake due to non-availability of proper protection



laws. *E scamming is very common and strong cyber security laws are not available. Although this policy has recommended a strong mechanism but still not implemented in true spirit*” (R2). While rest of the respondents were of the view that, *“policy has recommended very strong mechanism for establishing the e court, but it is still not implemented countrywide. Good and well reputed e commerce and online business are following the instructions carefully even within the country but social media platform or stores often reported as guilty of frauds and scams”* (R1 & 3).

### 9.2.8. *Socially Acceptable*

Without any doubt, this policy drew a lot of attention and was well received by the public. Robust directions of the E Commerce policy encourage the SMEs, women entrepreneurs, and startups to take advantage of opportunities that a digital future hold. When asked from the interviewees selected for the study, their responses were also positive. According to two of our respondents, *“I perceived the digital revolution as the result of boost in IT sector which successfully provides almost an equal playing field for the masses across the country”* (R1) and similarly as described by our 3<sup>rd</sup> respondent, *“People in this era are more equipped with mobiles and different internet packages irrespective of that them living in faraway areas having no basic infrastructure. For example, a seller / merchant can offer his/her products/items, to the consumers even living in these areas and Easy paisa, Jazz etc. help them to deal with payments for online orders”* (R3). However, one of our respondents shared some concerns regarding implementation of the E commerce policy from the social acceptance dimension. She said that *“Still the remote areas are deprived off. Internet, electricity, and Technological facilities are not available in far flung areas. Even the electricity, poor internet speed, etc. create hurdles in generating opportunities for the people living in such deprived off area both for at their earning part or contribution towards merchant’s income”* (R2).

## 10. Conclusion

The formation of an e-commerce policy is a step in recognizing the government's vision and commitment to effectively assist and encourage businesses to go online and boost broad e-commerce growth in Pakistan. .

Ministry of Trade and Commerce of Pakistan and Ministry of Information Technology and Telecommunication Technologies (MOITT) are jointly responsible to implement this policy through National E Commerce Council (NECC) constituted for the purpose. Security and Exchange Commission of Pakistan (SECP), State Bank of Pakistan (SBP) and Federal Bureau of Revenues (FBR), Pakistan Post, Bilateral Relationship Negotiation Agencies are big stakeholders who monitor online business registration platforms both local and international, online banking infrastructure, taxation, logistics and cross border trade matters for pursuing policy in best planned ways.

After conducting analysis, the researchers found some major shortcomings in the implementation of the E-commerce policy in Pakistan. These includes flaws in e-commerce business registration mechanism, e scams, cyber security, personal and financial data protection, E courts and dispute resolution mechanism, delayed payments, and logistical challenges in cross-border trade as well as taxation issues and confidence in online business. Most of the findings for the e-commerce policy implementation yielded positive effects. These include the utilization of available resources and eco system, the regulatory and legal infrastructure for e-commerce business registration, and the backing of appropriate government agencies.

## 11. Recommendations

E-commerce is playing a critical part in enhancing people's sources of income in Pakistan. In the last few years, Pakistan's ecommerce business has grown at an exponential rate. This rise has been fueled by lower transaction costs, convenience, and increased

internet penetration. Overall, this policy intends to pave the way for holistic e-Commerce growth in Pakistan by providing an atmosphere that allows all firms to flourish consistently.

To promote the growth of e-Commerce, a variety of policies are required, including addressing legislative inconsistencies, ensuring a level playing field for all e-Commerce market participants, ensuring transparency in the

economic activities of e-Commerce industries, and harmonizing tax systems, to name a few.

It's worth noting that this policy should be evaluated once a year to keep up with new developments in the digital economy and to solve any issues that may arise.

## References

- Ali, Muhammad, and Zahid Yousaf. "Qualitative Analysis About Future of Business to Business Marketing in Pakistan." *PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology* 18, no. 4 (2021): 3907-18.
- Batada, Dr Imran. "The Future of E-Commerce." Business, *The News International* (Islamabad), 2020.
- Braun, Virginia, and Victoria Clarke. "Using Thematic Analysis in Psychology." *Qualitative research in psychology* 3, no. 2 (2006): 77-101.
- Brown, Irwin, and Ruwanga Jayakody. "B2c E-Commerce Success: A Test and Validation of a Revised Conceptual Model." *The Electronic Journal Information Systems Evaluation* 11, no. 3 (2008): 167-84.
- Co-operation, Organisation for Economic, and Development Staff. *Education at a Glance: Oecd Indicators 2002*. OECD Paris, 2002.
- ESCAP, UN. "National Study on Digital Trade Integration on Pakistan." (2021).
- Giorgi, Amedeo. "A Phenomenological Perspective on Certain Qualitative Research Methods." *Journal of phenomenological psychology* 25, no. 2 (1994): 190-220.
- Goel, Ritendra. *E-Commerce*. New Age International, 2007.
- Imtiaz, Shoaib, Syed Hassan Ali, and Dong Jin Kim. "E-Commerce Growth in Pakistan: Privacy, Security, and Trust as Potential Issues." *Culinary Science & Hospitality Research* 26, no. 2 (2020): 10-18.
- ISMAIL, Y, and H HIRANI. "Addressing the Gender Dimension of E-Commerce: Towards a Holistic." (2021).
- Jatin, Shah, Dr Shah Anand, and Pietrobon Ricardo. "Scientific Writing of Novice Researchers: What Difficulties and Encouragements Do They Encounter?". *Academic medicine: journal of the Association of American Medical Colleges* 84, no. 4 (2009): 511.
- Javed, Asif. "Prospects and Problems for E-Commerce in Pakistan." *Asian Journal of Economics, Finance and Management* (2020): 131-39.
- Karine, HAJI. "E-Commerce Development in Rural and Remote Areas of Brics Countries." *Journal of Integrative Agriculture* 20, no. 4 (2021): 979-97.

**Title: E-Commerce Policy of Pakistan: Setting a Path to Development**

Author: Hafiz Amtul Matin, Amara Awan, Dr. Kashif Mahmood

Khoo, Vivian, Aidi Ahmi, and Ram Al-jaffri Saad. "A Comprehensive Review on E-Commerce Research." Paper presented at the AIP Conference Proceedings, 2018.

Malterud, Kirsti. "Qualitative Research: Standards, Challenges, and Guidelines." *The lancet* 358, no. 9280 (2001): 483-88.

Medeiros, Carlos Aguiar de, and Fernando Sarti. "Sovereignty, Development and Society." *Economia e Sociedade* 30 (2021): 595-617.

Mendelow, Aubrey L. "Environmental Scanning--the Impact of the Stakeholder Concept." (1981).

Morrison, James, and Kathryn Flegel. *Interviewing Children and Adolescents: Skills and Strategies for Effective Dsm-5? Diagnosis*. Guilford Publications, 2017.

Morton, M. "Applicability of Impact Evaluation to Cohesion Policy." Paper presented at the An Agenda for a Reformed Cohesion Policy. A place-based approach to meeting European Union challenges and expectations. Independent Report, 2009.

Nasir, Tahir Abbas, and Muhammad Abdullah. "Current Trends and Future of E-Commerce in Pakistan."

Ojha, Gana Pati. "Appreciative Inquiry Approach to Evaluation Practices in South Asia." *Revista de Cercetare și Intervenție Socială*, no. 30 (2010): 7-18.

Pakistan, E Commerce Policy of. *E Commerce Policy of Pakiatan*. Islamabad: MOITT, 2019.

Pakistan, Government of. *E Commerce Policy of Pakistan*, 2019.

Patton, Michael Quinn. "Qualitative Evaluation Checklist." *Evaluation checklists project* 21 (2003): 1-13.

Peña-López, Ismael. "Improving Governance with Policy Evaluation." (2020).

Roberts, Nancy. "Wicked Problems and Network Approaches to Resolution." *International public management review* 1, no. 1 (2000): 1-19.

Saunders, Mark NK, and Keith Townsend. "Reporting and Justifying the Number of Interview Participants in Organization and Workplace Research." *British Journal of Management* 27, no. 4 (2016): 836-52.

Smeets, Maarten. *Adapting to the Digital Trade Era: Challenges and Opportunities*. World Trade Organization, 2021.

Stufflebeam, Daniel L. "The Cipp Model for Evaluation." In *Evaluation Models*, 279-317: Springer, 2000.

Survey, Pakistan Economic. *Pakistan Economic Survey 2020-21*. Finance Ministry, Finance (Islamabad: Government of Pakistan, 2021). [https://www.pc.gov.pk/uploads/cpec/PES\\_2020\\_21.pdf](https://www.pc.gov.pk/uploads/cpec/PES_2020_21.pdf).

Tanveer, Muhammad. "Analytical Approach on Small and Medium Pakistani Businesses Based on E-Commerce Ethics with Effect on Customer Repurchase Objectives and Loyalty." *Journal of Legal, Ethical and Regulatory Issues* 24, no. 3 (2021): 1-20.

**Title: E-Commerce Policy of Pakistan: Setting a Path to Development**Author: Hafiz Amtul Matin, Amara Awan, Dr. Kashif Mahmood

---

Theodoulou, Stella Z, and Chris Kofinis. *The Art of the Game: Understanding American Public Policy Making*. Recording for the Blind & Dyslexic, 2004.

Tongco, Maria Dolores C. "Purposive Sampling as a Tool for Informant Selection." (2007).

Verdon, Joan. "Global E-Commerce Sales to Hit \$4.2 Trillion as Online Surge Continues, Adobe Reports. Forbes." 2021.

Whiting, Lisa S. "Semi-Structured Interviews: Guidance for Novice Researchers." *Nursing Standard (through 2013)* 22, no. 23 (2008): 35.

Zia, Ms Mehwish Darakhshan, Mr Muhammad Sajid, and Muhammad Siddique. "E-Commerce in Pakistan: A New Horizon for Pakistani Products in European Markets." *Journal of European Studies (JES)* 38, no. 1 (2021): 67-86.